



National Certificate of Educational Achievement  
TAUMATA MĀTAURANGA Ā-MOTU KUA TAEA

## **Exemplar for Internal Achievement Standard**

### **Religious Studies Level Three**

This exemplar supports assessment against:

**Achievement Standard 90826**

Analyse the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical  
issue

An annotated exemplar is an extract of student evidence, with a commentary, to explain key aspects of the standard. It assists teachers to make assessment judgements at the grade boundaries.

New Zealand Qualifications Authority

To support internal assessment

	Grade Boundary: Low Excellence
1.	<p>For Excellence, the student needs to analyse, with perception, the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• critically evaluating the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue</li> <li>• drawing conclusions that address the wider implications arising from the analysis.</li> </ul> <p>The student has analysed the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (1).</p> <p>The student has considered the response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion by explaining the beliefs that life begins at conception and that the foetus' right to life is equal to the mother's right to life (2).</p> <p>The student has critically evaluated the response of the religious tradition to the contemporary ethical issue with some perception when they considered the concept of the sacredness of life (3).</p> <p>The student has identified a wider social implication arising from the analysis (4).</p> <p>For a more secure Excellence, the student could further analyse, with perception, the response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion.</p> <p>For example, the student could provide evidence from further teachings of the Catholic Church (Vatican Documents like <i>Humanae Vitae</i> or <i>Donum Vitae</i>, and draw further conclusions as to how this teaching affects the members of Catholic Church and more of the possible wider social, historical, geographical, political or personal implications of the Catholic Church's response to abortion.</p>

Abortion is the name given to the situation in which a pregnancy is ended before the term has been completed. The foetus dies. This can occur naturally or it can be procured by a surgical procedure. Abortion has been legal in some countries like the UK since 1967, but in NZ this was not the case. However, in 1971 New Zealand women with means could obtain a legal abortion in the two States of Victoria and New South Wales in Australia due to a change in the law over there. Abortions were performed in New Zealand in 1974 in the Auckland Medical Aid Centre. However this was closed until a legal battle was sorted and abortion was allowed and restricted to public hospitals in 1975. The legal battles continues and although it is legal under the Contraception, Sterilisation, and Abortion Bill. After many amendments and one all-night sitting, the National bill was passed on 15 December 1977. There have continued to be challenges to the Bill since this time.

1

In New Zealand the Abortion procedures are either through 'Surgical abortion', by dilatation of the cervix and suction curettage is the most common method used in New Zealand for first trimester and some second trimester abortions. Or by a 'Medical abortion' which uses pills rather than surgery. It is more like an induction of labour and is commonly used for second trimester pregnancy. These two are known as 'induced abortions' and are different from a 'Spontaneous abortion' which is usually called a miscarriage. Early medical abortion (up to nine weeks) was introduced into New Zealand in 2001 and is currently provided in the following units (Te Mahoe Unit in Wellington, Masterton Hospital in the Wairarapa, Gisborne Hospital, Lyndhurst Clinic in Christchurch, Dunedin Hospital in the Otago District Health Board, the Auckland Medical Aid Centre (AMAC), the Epsom Day Unit and Surgery on Shakespeare in Auckland).

1

The Catholic Church says that abortion is wrong. Life begins at conception and the foetus' right to life is equal to the mother's. "From the time that the ovum is fertilised, a life is begun which is neither that of the father nor the mother. It is rather the life of a new human being with its own growth. It would never be made human if it were not human already." (Declaration on procured abortion of the Roman Catholic Church 1974).

2

Human beings, made in the image and likeness of Te Atua, have a value above other created beings and this should be respected and is not if an abortion is carried out. We need to live by choosing and living according to true values, which placed the sacredness of each individual from the moment of conception as of the highest priority.

3

The New Zealand Catholic Bishops say, "Every human is a unique masterpiece, yet each is a likeness of God individually and separately hand-drawn by the Creator and destined, through union with Christ to live forever" (What's wrong with Abortion NZCBC 1989).

2

This means that the potential each person has to fulfil is there from the moment of conception and we would lose this if an abortion were carried out. The result of that loss cannot be measured.

3

The fact that it is an issue that still causes heated debate on both sides' shows that abortion is not an easy action to take or condone.

If people in the wider New Zealand society decided to consider that a human being was considered to exist from the moment of conception the number of abortions would probably reduce each year.

4

	Grade Boundary: High Merit
2.	<p>For Merit, the student needs to analyse in depth the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• discussing the ethical principles of the religious tradition that influenced the response</li> <li>• drawing conclusions supported by a range of evidence.</li> </ul> <p>The student has analysed the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (1).</p> <p>The student has discussed two ethical principles, the dignity of the human person and love and justice, as responses of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (2).</p> <p>The student has drawn conclusions about the Catholic Church’s response to the issue of abortion, supported by evidence from Scripture, Papal authority, NZ Catholic Bishops and Vatican documents (3).</p> <p>To reach Excellence, the student could provide a critical evaluation of the response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion, and draw conclusions that address the wider implications arising from this analysis.</p> <p>For example, the student could provide evidence from further teachings of the Catholic Church documents such as <i>Theology of the Body St John Paul II</i>, <i>Deus Caritas Est Pope Benedict XVI</i> or <i>Ethical Directives for Catholic Hospitals USCCB</i>, and the various responses to them from the secular world.</p>

When a woman decides to have an Abortion, she does so because she has thought about the issue. An abortion is when a pregnancy is ended before the term has been completed. The foetus dies. This can occur in two ways either naturally or it can be procured by a surgical procedure. Abortion has been legal in some countries like the UK since 1967, but in NZ this was not the case.

①

However, in 1971 New Zealand women who had lots of money and found themselves pregnant could obtain a legal abortion in the two States of Victoria and New South Wales in Australia due to a change in the law over there but not in New Zealand. Abortions were performed in New Zealand in 1974 in the Auckland Medical Aid Centre. However this was closed until a legal battle was sorted and abortion was allowed and restricted to public hospitals in 1975. The legal battles continues and although it is legal under the contraception, Sterilisation, and Abortion Bill. After many amendments and one all-night sitting, the National bill was passed on 15 December 1977. There have continued to be challenges to the Bill since this time by lots of different groups.

In New Zealand the Abortion procedures are either through 'Surgical abortion', by dilatation of the cervix and suction curettage is the most common method used in New Zealand for first trimester and some second trimester abortions. Or by a 'Medical abortion' which uses pills rather than surgery. It is more like an induction of labour and is commonly used for second trimester pregnancy. These two are known as 'induced abortions' and are different from a 'Spontaneous abortion' which is usually called a miscarriage. Early medical abortion (up to nine weeks) was introduced into New Zealand in 2001 and is currently provided in the following units (Te Mahoe Unit in Wellington, Masterton Hospital in the Wairarapa, Gisborne Hospital, Lyndhurst Clinic in Christchurch, Dunedin Hospital in the Otago District Health Board, the Auckland Medical Aid Centre (AMAC), the Epsom Day Unit and Surgery on Shakespeare in Auckland).

①

The Catholic Church does not support abortions as they are considered to be killing a baby which is made in the image and likeness of God (Gen 1:27).

③

This follows on from the ethical principle that of the dignity of the human person where every person is considered sacred.

②

The Church recognises that this is a very important issue and has ethical implications. The Church expects people to protect those who are the most vulnerable in society and this includes a baby in the womb. Especially since the baby would not be able to defend itself. The NZ Bishops statement called a 'Consistent Ethic of Life: Te Kahu-O-Te-Ora' says that we need to create 'an environment within families and society where pregnant mothers are support'. This means we need to move away from the 'Culture of death' spoken of by Popes St John Paul II and Benedict XVI and have or create a society which sees each individual from conception as being one which needs to be loved and nurtured by us all.

②

③

The ethical principle of love and justice may also be considered in relation to abortion. To love means to give justice so that a person is respected and has their human rights protected, so that their development is possible.

②

This is because the love of neighbour, in this case the foetus demands justice for the unborn child, which has the potential to be all that is human from the moment of conception (Psalm 139:13). The human person at all stages of life must be protected and its rights defended at all costs (*Donum vitae*, n. 5).

3

By promoting this ethical principle the Catholic Church is trying to transform those structures that make it possible to destroy the human being and so the love of God.

2

	Grade Boundary: Low Merit
3.	<p>For Merit, the student needs to analyse in depth the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• discussing the ethical principles of the religious tradition that influenced the response</li> <li>• drawing conclusions supported by a range of evidence.</li> </ul> <p>The student has discussed two ethical principles, the dignity of the human person and the common good, as responses of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (1).</p> <p>The student has drawn some conclusions about the Catholic Church's response to the issue of abortion supported by evidence from Scripture, Papal authority and the NZ Catholic Bishops (2).</p> <p>For a more secure Merit, the student could provide further analysis of the response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion, especially in relation to the ethical principle of the common good.</p> <p>In addition, the student could draw further conclusions using a wider range of supporting evidence by citing Vatican documents such as <i>Humanae Vitae</i> on Responsible Parenthood, and <i>Catechism of the Catholic Church</i>.</p>



Student 3: Low Merit

NZQA Intended for teacher use only

The Catholic Church does not agree with abortion as it is seen to be breaking the Law of God in which all life is seen as sacred and created by God as explained by the ethical principle of dignity of the human person. This means that only God can take life away. Abortion is the taking of life by one human being of another, this means it is murder. Abortion is a moral problem and has ethical issues which go with it. The law in New Zealand allows for women to have abortions but there are certain circumstances that have to be met. The Catholic Church considers because we have so many abortions in New Zealand over 180 thousands that the circumstances need to be looked at again, because this is following what St John Paul II called a 'culture of death'.

1

2

An abortion is performed by a doctor and can happen if the woman feels psychologically unable to have the baby. By calling the baby a foetus some people think that it is not really a baby and just a clump of cells and so it makes it easier for a woman to make the decision. Abortion needs two doctors to agree it should happen which is good because it spreads the load of the guilt they may feel. There is no upper time limit in New Zealand law for Abortion. The Catholic Church says this is wrong because you are a person from the moment of conception and not just after 20 weeks or later. The New Zealand Catholic Bishops statement 'What's wrong with Abortion' says this. Scripture also says it is wrong when in the 5<sup>th</sup> Commandment it says, "You shall not kill" (Exodus 20). Abortion is killing and so breaks this commandment and making it lawful in a country does not make it right.

2

2

Another ethical principle that is linked to abortion is the common good. When this principle is followed then individual rights are always experienced within the context of the promotion of the common good. The common good would relate to the rights of the baby and its potential in society.

1

This means that all 'conditions of social living must make it possible for women and men to really and fully achieve the perfection of humanity' (NCRS 12B Justice and Peace). If a person is abort then they do not have the possibility of achieving their full potential.

2

	Grade Boundary: High Achieved
4.	<p>For Achieved, the student needs to analyse the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• considering in detail a contemporary ethical issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• considering in detail the response of the religious tradition to the issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• drawing conclusions about the response of the religious tradition to the issue, supported by evidence.</li> </ul> <p>The student has discussed the contemporary ethical issue of abortion in detail (1).</p> <p>The student has considered in detail the ethical principle of the dignity of the human person, as a response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (2).</p> <p>The student has drawn conclusions about the Catholic Church’s response to the issue of abortion, supported by evidence from Scripture, Papal authority and the NZ Catholic Bishops (3).</p> <p>To reach Merit, the student could provide further analysis of the response of the Catholic Church to abortion in relation to a second ethical principle, such as the common good or love and justice.</p> <p>In addition, the student could draw further conclusions using a wider range of supporting evidence. For example, the student could provide a further breakdown of the details of abortion, and use evidence from the teachings of the Catholic Church regarding their ethical principles to explain the Church’s stance against abortion (e.g. Vatican Documents like <i>Humanae Vitae</i> and <i>Catechism of the Catholic Church</i>).</p>

Abortion is the forcible removal of a baby from the womb by a qualified doctor who is following the law of the land. The abortion can happen if a woman fulfils certain criteria outlined in the law. New Zealand has had laws in place about abortion since the 1800's. These laws give the doctor guidance about when they can do an abortion. There are a number of ways in which an abortion can happen, such as a surgical or a medical abortion.

1

Abortion means the foetus dies. This can occur naturally or it can be procured by a surgical procedure. Abortion has been legal in some countries like the UK since 1967, but in NZ this was not the case. However in 1971 New Zealand women with means could obtain a legal abortion in the two States of Victoria and New South Wales in Australia due to a change in the law over there. Abortions have been performed in New Zealand since 1974 in the Auckland Medical Aid Centre. However, this was closed until a legal battle was sorted and abortion was allowed and restricted to public hospitals in 1975. The legal battles continues and although it is legal under the Contraception, Sterilisation, and Abortion Bill. After many amendments and one all-night sitting, the National bill was passed on 15 December 1977. There have continued to be challenges to the Bill since this time.

1

In New Zealand the Abortion procedures are either through 'Surgical abortion', by dilatation of the cervix and suction curettage is the most common method used in New Zealand for first trimester and some second trimester abortions. Or by a 'Medical abortion' which uses pills rather than surgery. It is more like an induction of labour and is commonly used for second trimester pregnancy. These two are known as 'induced abortions' and are different from a 'Spontaneous abortion' which is usually called a miscarriage.

1

1

The Catholic Church says in the 5<sup>th</sup> Commandment 'you shall not kill', so abortion is wrong because it is killing the baby in the womb.

3

The baby is a gift from God and so should not be killed under any circumstances and this goes with the principle of human dignity of the person.

2

Every human being is created by God and in his image and likeness (Gen 1:27) and so should be protected and loved by us all.

3

Benedict XVI spoke of a 'culture of death' in the world where people do not care about those who are not part of their family or community. Benedict XVI in *Deus caritas est* (2005) discussed that we need to be a community, which protects the vulnerable in society. Babies who are being aborted are these vulnerable in society.

3

If a woman is thinking about having an abortion then she can turn to the Catholic Church and ask for help through groups like Project Rachel in the NZ Catholic Church.

3

	Grade Boundary: Low Achieved
5.	<p>For Achieved, the student needs to analyse the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• considering in detail a contemporary ethical issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• considering in detail the response of the religious tradition to the issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• drawing conclusions about the response of the religious tradition to the issue, supported by evidence.</li> </ul> <p>The student has discussed the contemporary ethical issue of abortion in some detail (1).</p> <p>The student has considered one ethical principle, the dignity of a human person, as a response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (2).</p> <p>The student has drawn limited conclusions about the Catholic Church's response to the issue of abortion, supported by evidence from Scripture and Papal authority (3).</p> <p>For a more secure Achieved, the student could provide further details about the components or essential features of the contemporary ethical issue of abortion.</p> <p>In addition, they could consider in more detail the response of the Catholic Church to abortion, and draw more substantial conclusions supported by evidence from Vatican documents such as <i>Humanae Vitae</i>, <i>Catechism of the Catholic Church</i>, and/or the NZCBC <i>Consistent Ethic of Life</i>.</p>

Abortion is the removal of a baby from the womb. The removal is done by a doctor before the baby is ready to be born. The abortion can only take place if two doctors say so, according to the law in New Zealand.

1

Abortion means the foetus dies. This can occur naturally or it can be procured by a surgical procedure. In New Zealand in 1970's a women with means could obtain a legal abortion in the two States of Victoria and New South Wales in Australia due to a change in the law over there. Abortions have been performed in New Zealand since 1974 in the Auckland Medical Aid Centre. However, this was stopped until a legal battle was sorted and abortion was allowed and restricted to public hospitals in 1975.

1

The legal battles continues and although it is legal under the Contraception, Sterilisation, and Abortion Bill. After many amendments and one all-night sitting, the National bill was passed on 15 December 1977. Not everyone agrees with the right to abortions even today.

1

The Catholic Church does not think that abortion is a good idea and condemns it because it is seen as murder, (Exodus 20) and against the ethical principle of the dignity of a human person.

3

It is in the 10 commandments that we don't kill someone else. This is what abortion does when a woman has it. St John Paul II said we lived in a 'culture of death' in the world. He meant this about abortion because it involves death of the baby, which has not been born.

2

There are different types of abortion depending upon which doctor performs it and how pregnant the woman is. The Catholic Church does not think any of the types are good, as they do not see the baby as sacred and a gift from God. I agree with the Catholic Church because it is murder and so not a good thing to do.

3

2

It can be seen as a waste of a human life and so not fulfilling John 10:10-11, when Jesus said he had come so we could have life to the full. Abortion is not having life to the 'full' as Jesus wishes.

3

	Grade Boundary: High Not Achieved
6.	<p>For Achieved, the student needs to analyse the response of a religious tradition to a contemporary ethical issue.</p> <p>This involves:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• considering in detail a contemporary ethical issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• considering in detail the response of the religious tradition to the issue, and breaking it down into components or essential features</li> <li>• drawing conclusions about the response of the religious tradition to the issue, supported by evidence.</li> </ul> <p>The student has discussed the contemporary ethical issue of abortion in limited detail (1).</p> <p>The student has implied one ethical principle, the dignity of a human person as a response of the Catholic Church to the contemporary ethical issue of abortion (2). The student has drawn a limited conclusion about the Catholic Church’s response to the issue of abortion, supported by some biblical evidence (3).</p> <p>To reach Achieved, the student could provide more detail about the components or essential features of the contemporary ethical issue of abortion.</p> <p>In addition, they could consider in detail the response of the Catholic Church to abortion, and draw conclusions supported by evidence from Scripture and Vatican documents like <i>Humanae Vitae</i>, <i>Catechism of the Catholic Church</i>, and/or the <i>NZCBC Consistent Ethic of Life</i>.</p>

Student 6: High Not Achieved

NZQA Intended for teacher use only

The Catholic Church thinks abortion is wrong because God said so in the Bible when he said do not kill other people. A baby is another person.

2

Abortion is when a baby dies after it is taken from the womb by another person usually a doctor. Jesus would not like abortions because he likes and even loved little children and abortion gets rid of little children.

1

The abortion takes place in a sterilised room and the doctor does it. The woman who has the abortion does not have to stay overnight because the abortion is done quickly for her.

1

Abortion is wrong.

A baby should be allowed to live because in the 10 Commandments it says 'Thou shalt not kill' In Exodus, and as I said the Catholic Church thinks killing is wrong, so you would be going against the Bible and so going against God which is not the right thing to do. A woman having an abortion is killing her baby. The doctor too is killing the baby and this is not right. Doctors who kill babies would not want any other doctor to kill their baby.

3

I think this because the Catholics says so and so does my Nan and she is a good Catholic . She goes to Church every day and prays for all those babies that have been aborted so that they will get to heaven. She also prays for the woman and doctors who have and do abortions that they will ask God for forgiveness for the sin they have committed.